Legal Writing & Research Citators: KeyCite and Shepard's

Why do legal researchers use citators?

- For **verification**:
 - What is the **direct history** of your case?
 - How do other courts view your case?
 - Is the point of law you want to use **still good law**?
- For research:
 - Are there other cases that cite your case positively? (You may be able to use those cases, too.)
 - Are there secondary sources that cite or explain your case?

Important notes

- You can use citators for **statutes** as well as **cases**.
- The flags and citator reports are **tools** to help you identify potential weaknesses, but they don't do the analysis for you.
- Make sure you allocate **sufficient time** to review citator reports for **each case and statute** you will rely on. You may have to review and analyze treatment of your source by **many** other cases so do not leave it to the last minute!

Citators: A Step-by-Step Guide

Westlaw (KeyCite)

- 1. Select **History** to view the direct history of your case, including any appellate history.
 - If there is a red flag, you must determine which point of law is no longer good law.
 - You <u>cannot use the case</u> if it has been overturned for the same point of law.
- 2. Click on the Negative Treatment (if applicable) and Citing References tabs
 - Negative Treatment shows the negative direct history and negative citing references.
 - Citing References shows all sources citing your case.
 - Filter by Cases (citing references can also be secondary sources)
 - o Filter by Headnote or search within results as necessary
 - For any negative history, you must <u>read</u> and determine for <u>every case citing your case</u>:
 - a. Is it from a court in the direct line of appeal?
 - b. Is it on the same legal issue?
 - c. Is the holding actually negative? Or can the other court's holding be explained by a difference in facts?

- A red flag warns that the case or administrative decision is no longer good law for at least one of the points it contains.
- A yellow flag warns that the case or administrative decision has some negative history, but has not been reversed or overruled.
- A blue-striped flag warns that the case has been appealed to the U.S. Court of Appeals or the U.S. Supreme Court (excluding appeals originating from agencies).
- An Overruling Risk warning indicates that a case or administrative decision may no longer be good for at least one point of law based on its reliance on an overruled or otherwise invalid prior decision.

Lexis (Shepard's)

- 1. Click on Shepardize document.
- 2. Select the **History tab** to view the direct history of your case.
 - If there is a warning or caution sign, you must determine which point of law is no longer good law.
 - You cannot use the case if it has been overturned for the same point of law.
- 3. Select the Citing Decisions tab to view a list of the cases that have cited your case.
 - Filter by Headnote or search within results as necessary
 - If there is negative history (under Caution), you must <u>read</u> and determine for <u>every case citing your case</u>:
 - a. Is it from a court in the direct line of appeal?
 - b. Is it on the same legal issue?
 - c. Is the holding actually negative? Or can the other court's holding be explained by a difference in facts?

- WARNING: Negative treatment is indicated
- (!) WARNING: Negative case treatment is indicated for statute
- QUESTIONED: Validity questioned by citing references
- A CAUTION: Possible negative treatment
- POSITIVE: Positive treatment is indicated
- NEUTRAL: Citing references with treatment is available
- CITED BY: Citation information is available